

Central University of Punjab Bathinda

MINUTES



57th Meeting of the EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

5th February 2025



Minutes of **57th Meeting of the Executive Council**

57th Meeting of the Executive Council of the Central University of Punjab was held on 5th February 2025 at 4:00 p.m. onwards in hybrid Mode.

Venue: Conference Room, Aryabhata Academic Block, Adjacent Vice-Chancellor's Office.

The list of the members present during the meeting on 5th February 2025 is annexed.

The Chairman of the Executive Council welcomed all the members present in the meeting, especially the external members, namely Prof. KRS Sambasiva Rao and Prof. Manoj Dixit who attended the meeting in online mode.

After detailed discussions on the agenda item listed for this meeting, the unanimous resolutions of the Council are as follows:

<i>Items for Consideration</i>	
<u>Item.No:EC:57:2025:1</u> To approve the Minutes of Meeting of 59th Building Committee held on 21.12.2024.	AGENDA NOTE: The minutes of meeting of 59 th Building Committee held on 21.12.2024. The draft minutes of this meeting were circulated to the members of the Building Committee. Members have conveyed their consent for approval of minutes, through mail. The Executive Council may like to consider and approve the minutes of meeting of 59 th Building Committee held on 21.12.2024.
<u>RESOLVE:</u>	The Council unanimously resolved to approve the minutes of 59th Building Committee held on 21.12.2024.
<u>Item.No:EC:57:2025:2</u> To approve the minutes of 35th Meeting of the Finance Committee held on 26.12.2024	AGENDA NOTE: The 35 th meeting of the Finance Committee was held on 26.12.2024. The draft minutes of this meeting were circulated to the members of the Finance Committee. Members have conveyed their consent for approval of minutes, through mail. The minutes of the 35 th meeting of the Finance Committee is placed before the Council for approval.



<u>RESOLVE:</u>	The Council unanimously resolved to approve the minutes 35th Meeting of the Finance Committee held on 26.12.2024.
<u>Item.No:EC:57:2025:3</u> To approve the minutes of 36th Meeting of the Finance Committee held on 22.01.2025.	AGENDA NOTE: <p>The 36th meeting of the Finance Committee was held on 22.1.2025.</p> <p>The draft minutes of this meeting were circulated to the members of the Finance Committee.</p> <p>Members have conveyed their consent for approval of minutes, through mail.</p> <p>The minutes of the 36th meeting of the Finance Committee is placed before the Council for approval.</p>
<u>RESOLVE:</u>	The Council unanimously resolved to approve the minutes 36th Meeting of the Finance Committee held on 22.01.2025.
<u>Item.No:EC:57:2025:4</u> To consider and approve the recommendations of Finance Committee w.r.t. hiring of PMC for execution of construction works estimated for Rs. 200.99 Cr. (under the HEFA Term Loan of Rs. 210.99 crore) sanctioned to the University.	AGENDA NOTE: <p>The matter for appointment of Project Management Consultant (PMC) for construction of new buildings was considered by the Building Committee in its 58th meeting held on 08.08.2024 vide agenda item No:BC:58:2024:11.</p> <p>The recommendations of the Building Committee for selection of PMC among PSU's through QCBS method by inviting EOI on similar terms of CU Haryana were considered and approved by the Finance Committee in its 33rd meeting held on 30.08.2024 vide item No:FC:33:2024:2 and the Executive Council in its 52nd meeting held on 19.08.2024 vide item No:EC:52:2024:4.</p> <p>Subsequent to the statutory approvals, a Consultancy Evaluation Committee (CEC) was constituted vide notification No. CUPB/RO/Notification/24-25/53 dated 17.09.2024 (Annexure - 57.1). The Expression of Interest for hiring Project Management Consultancy Services for Planning, Designing and Development of the infrastructural facilities and other related works was called on CPP portal, e-publish on GeM-CPPP and University website on 23.09.2024. The pre-bid meeting was held on 30.09.2024 at 11 AM and minutes were uploaded on the university website.</p> <p>The three firms i.e. Engineers India Limited, RITES Limited and NBCC (India) Limited participated in the Expression of Interest (EOI) and were found eligible as per EOI document.</p> <p>As per rule 186 of GFR 2017, the Request for Proposal (RFP) as finalized by CEC in its 4th Meeting was sent to all the eligible</p>



bidders on 06.11.2024. The approved minutes of 1st to 4th meeting of CEC are placed **(Annexure – 57.2)**.

The CEC in its 5th meeting held on 20.11.2024 noted the details of the queries raised by the firms and the reply of the queries was intimated to all the three bidder through email dated 25.11.2024. The approved minutes of 5th meeting of CEC are placed **(Annexure – 57.3)**. The last date of submission of technical and Financial bids was 28.11.2024. All the three bidders submitted their technical and financial bids on or before the last date of submission i.e. 28.11.2024. The bids of all the three bidders were opened by CEC in its 6th Meeting. The approved minutes of 6th meeting of CEC are placed **(Annexure – 57.4)**

Based on the submitted documents, the Consultancy Evaluation Committee in its 7th meeting held on 06.12.2024 evaluated the technical score of the three eligible firms. The minutes comprising of technical score (documents) were circulated to CEC members through email dated 06.12.24 **(Annexure – 57.5)**. The approved minutes of 7th meeting of CEC are placed **(Annexure – 57.6)**. Thereafter, the presentation of all the three eligible firms were scheduled on 09.12.2024. Based on the presentations, the CEC members evaluated the technical score for the presentation based on different parameters detailed in RFP document and as per the relative weightage informed to all the bidders. The presentation of the eligible bidders was held on 09.12.2024, wherein all the members of CEC evaluated the bidders based on the presentation and accordingly, the consolidated technical score including document and presentation was finalized by CEC in its 8th meeting held on 09.12.2024. The minutes comprising of technical score (documents) & Technical Score (Presentation) were circulated to CEC members through email dated 09.12.24 **(Annexure – 57.7)**. The approved minutes of 8th meeting of CEC are placed **(Annexure – 57.8)**. The technical scores are as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the bidder	Technical score (Documents)	Technical score (Presentation)	Total technical score
1.	M/s Engineers India Limited	62.86	22.20	85.06
2.	M/s RITES Limited	60.14	20.40	80.54
3.	M/s NBCC (India) Limited	68.29	25.00	93.29



On the recommendations of CEC in its 8th meeting and approval of Competent Authority, the financial bids were opened on 12.12.2024 with prior information to all the three firms and its publicity on the university website. The representatives of all the three eligible firms were present during the financial bid opening. They also checked and verified the sealed envelopes of the financial bid submitted by their respective organization. The financial quote of the bidders is tabulated as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the bidder	Financial quote
1.	M/s Engineers India Limited	6.23%
2.	M/s RITES Limited	2.95%
3.	M/s NBCC (India) Limited	4.50%

As the EOI and the RFP document were called on QCBS method, wherein the technical score (TS) and the financial score (FS) are given the relative weightage as detailed in the RFP document and the composite score (CS) is calculated using the following formula:

$$CS = 0.80 \times TS + 0.20 \times FS.$$

Accordingly, the consolidated score of all the three eligible has been calculated as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the bidder	Technical score (TS)	Financial Score (FS)	Composite score (CS) (CS = 0.80 x TS + 0.20 x FS)	Rating
1.	M/s Engineers India Limited	85.06	47.35	77.52	H3
2.	M/s RITES Limited	80.54	100	84.43	H2
3.	M/s NBCC (India) Limited	93.29	65.56	87.74	H1

As per clause no. 7.4 of the RFP document, The TQBs will be ranked accordingly to their **Composite Scores** and will be listed in the order of merit as H1, H2 and H3 and so on. The top scorer bidder (H1) shall be eligible for the award of the work as PMC.

As per recommendations of the CEC in its 9th meeting held on 12.12.2024 (**Annexure - 57.9**), the work for Appointment of the PMC for the construction of new buildings in the Central University of Punjab may be awarded to the **H1 bidder M/s**



	<p>NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted price of rates of 4.5% plus GST.</p> <p>The recommendations of CEC were considered by the Building Committee in its 59th Meeting held on 21.12.24 for allotment of the work to H1 bidder M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted price of rates of 4.5% plus GST.</p> <p><u>Following discussions were held during the 59th Building Committee Meeting:</u></p> <p>During the meeting, the members of the Committee discussed the matter and enquired about the detailed process adopted for hiring of Project Management Consultant for construction works. Executive Engineer, CU Punjab informed that as per Rule no. 192 to 194 of GFR 2017, three methods are prescribed for selection of consultancy firm. All the three methods were discussed in detail during the 24th meeting of PMC and 58th Meeting of BC. On the recommendations of PMC and approval of Building Committee in its 58th meeting, the Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method was adopted in the present case. The Executive Engineer also informed the BC that various technical parameters used in evaluation and their relative score was already detailed in RFP document. Further different parameters for presentation and their relative weightage were also informed to all the three bidders through email. As such entire selection process was carried out in the transparent manner.</p> <p>Further, Er. Rajender Kalla, Additional Director General (Retd.), CPWD informed to the Committee that QCBS is the best and most appropriate method for appointment of Consultancy Firm and therefore the same was recommended by the Building Committee in its 58th meeting. He also clarified that the technical and financial weightage ratio of 80:20 adopted by the CEC is the standard ratio generally adopted across all the Central Government works for the appointment of consultancy agency and in the QCBS method the work is awarded to the Highest composite scoring (H1) bidder.</p> <p>Prof. V. K. Garg, Chairman, Project Monitoring Committee, CU Punjab, suggested that for future reference, the Engineering Office should seek information from NBCC (India) Ltd, the H1 bidder recommend by the committee through QCBS method, for Consultancy Fee including PMC, Architectural and TPQI being charged by them for 5 no. of projects (on-going/ completed) during the last 5 years. Accordingly, the information was sought from NBCC (India) Ltd through email dated 21.12.2024 and the desired information was provided by NBCC (India) Ltd</p>
--	---



	<p>through reply email Annexed as 57.10. <u>After considering the matter, the Building Committee resolved as under:</u></p> <p><i>"The Building Committee noted that:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>1. <u>The Consultancy Evaluation Committee was constituted as per GFR-2017 and manual of procurement of consultancy services by MoF as resolved by Building Committee in its 58th Meeting vide agenda item no. BC: 58:2024:11.</u></i> <i>2. <u>The Committee also noted that the Selection of PMC has been done by calling EoI and RFP on QCBS method as per GFR-2017 as resolved by Building Committee in its 58th Meeting vide agenda item no. BC: 58:2024:11 and approved by the Finance Committee and Executive Council.</u></i> <p><i><u>Therefore, the Committee after deliberated discussions, unanimously resolved to approve the recommendations of the 9th meeting of Consultancy Evaluation Committee, held on 12.12.2024, to award the work for Appointment of the PMC to the H1 bidder i.e. M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted consultancy fee of 4.5% plus GST for the buildings to be constructed out of new HEFA loan of Rs. 210.99 Cr. in the Central University of Punjab campus."</u></i> <i>(Copy of relevant item of 59th Building Committee enclosed as Annexure-57.11)</i></p> <p>The above recommendations of Building Committee for Appointment of PMC to the H1 bidder i.e. M/s NBCC (India) Limited at its quoted consultancy fee of 4.5% plus GST for the buildings to be constructed with estimated cost of Rs. 200.99 Cr. (out of sanctioned HEFA loan of Rs. 210.99 Cr.) in the Central University of Punjab was considered by Finance Committee in its 35th meeting held on 26.12.2024 vide agenda item no: Item: FC: 35:2024:2.</p> <p>The Finance Committee resolved as under:</p> <p><i>"The Finance Committee after detailed discussions on the agenda item unanimously resolved that the University should negotiate with the H1 bidder i.e. M/s NBCC (India) Limited to bring down its quoted consultancy fee i.e. 4.5% plus GST.</i></p> <p><i>Further, the Committee also resolved that the outcome of the negotiation be presented in the next meeting of the Finance Committee."</i></p> <p>As per resolve of 35th meeting of the Finance Committee held on</p>
--	---



	<p>26.12.2024, a Committee was constituted by the University for negotiation with H1 bidder M/s NBCC (India) limited and was notified vide notification No.: CUPB/RO/Notification/24-25/116 dated 27.12.2024. The negotiation meeting was held on 10.01.2025 with the H1 bidder NBCC (India) Limited. After carrying out the negotiation NBCC have offered the revised financial quote of 4.1 % plus GST against the previous quote of 4.5% plus GST.</p> <p>The minutes of the Committee for negotiation with H1 bidder is placed as Annexure – 57.12. The revised offer of reduced PMC fees of 4.1% by NBCC (India) Limited was received vide e-mail dated 14.01.25 and is placed as Annexure – 57.13.</p> <p>The matter was placed before the Finance Committee in its 36th meeting held on 22.1.2025 vide item no. Item.No:FC:36:2024:1 for its consideration to award the work of PMC for construction of new buildings to H1 bidder M/s NBCC (India) Limited at revised quoted rate of 4.1% plus GST.</p> <p>The resolve of the Finance Committee is reproduced as under: <i>The members of Finance Committee after detailed discussions on the matter emphasized that the University should again discuss with the H1 bidder M/s NBCC (India) Ltd. to further reduce the offered PMC charges of 4.1% + GST. Accordingly, during the meeting, M/s NBCC India Ltd. was contacted telephonically, consequently, they agreed to further reduce the offered PMC charges from 4.1% + GST to <u>4.0% + GST</u>. (Letter enclosed as <u>Annexure 36.3</u>).</i></p> <p><i>Considering the above, the Finance Committee unanimously resolved to hire M/s NBCC India Ltd. as Project Management Consultant (PMC) at final PMC charges @ 4.0% + GST for the construction of following buildings out of HEFA Loan of Rs. 200.99 Cr.:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Academic Block 2. 400 seater Girls' Hostel 3. 600 seater Boys' Hostel 4. International Students' Hostel 5. Vice-Chancellor's Residence <hr/> <p>The matter is placed before the Executive Council to consider and approve the above recommendations of 36th Meeting of the Finance Committee to hire M/s NBCC India Ltd. as Project Management Consultant (PMC) at final PMC charges @ 4.0% + GST (Annexure-57.14) for the construction of buildings estimated for Rs. 200.99 Cr. out of sanctioned HEFA Loan of Rs.</p>
--	--



	210.99 Cr.
<u>RESOLVE:</u>	<p>The Executive Council, after detailed discussions, unanimously resolved to approve the recommendation of the Finance Committee to hire M/s NBCC India Ltd. as Project Management Consultant (PMC) at final PMC charges @ 4.0% + GST (Annexure-57.14) for the construction of following buildings estimated for Rs. 200.99 Cr. out of sanctioned HEFA Loan of Rs. 210.99 Cr.:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Academic Block 2. 400 seater Girls' Hostel 3. 600 seater Boys' Hostel 4. International Students' Hostel 5. Vice-Chancellor's Residence
Any other item with permission of the Chair – <i>No item discussed.</i>	
<p>To fix the date of next meeting of the Executive Council: <i>The Council authorized the Chairman to fix the next date of meeting.</i></p>	

The meeting of the Executive Council concluded with thanks from and to the Chair.

Sd/-
(Dr. Vijay Sharma)
Registrar &
Secretary, Executive Council

Minutes Approved

Sd/-
(Prof. Raghavendra P. Tiwari)
Vice-Chancellor &
Chairman, Executive Council